Establishing a Successful Accessible Media Program in Higher Education: A Overview of Workflows, Costs, and Next Steps at George Mason University
TODAY’S AGENDA

- Who we are
- Mandates
- How we got started
- Overview of the captioning workflow
- Breaking down numbers
- Next steps
- Contact Info
LOCATION AND ENROLLMENT

- Enrollment (Projected Fall 2018)
  - ~34k+ students from 130+ countries
  - Projected increases of 1k students per year over next 5-6 years (online)

- Over 1500+ Instructional and Research Faculty

- 10 colleges and schools

- Campus locations
  - 4 locations in Northern Virginia (Fairfax/Main, Arlington, Manassas, and Sterling)
  - International: Songdo (Korea)
## ATI’s Mission & Services

### Mission
- Develop, coordinate, and implement a university-wide technology accessibility plan

### Services
- Accessible Text (alternate formats)
- Accessible Media (captioning/transcription)
- Web Accessibility
- Assistive Technology Assessments, Support, and Training
ATI Staff & Reporting Structure

- ATI operates under Compliance, Diversity, and Ethics Office
  - Reports up through ADA Coordinator to VP for CDE, who reports directly to University President

- More information about us available at http://ati.gmu.edu

- Presentation: https://ati.gmu.edu/resources/presentations/
ACCESSIBILITY@MASON:
A COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIP

Students w/ Disabilities

CDE

DS

Employees w/ Disabilities

ATI

ICT Accessibility & Compliance
THE LEGAL LANDSCAPE AND TECHNOLOGY ACCESSIBILITY IN HIGHER ED
DISABILITY LAWS: 504 AND ADA

Rehabilitation Act (1973): 504
- Equivalent access to all federal programs and services receiving federal financial assistance

ADA (1998): Titles II, III
- Extended 504 to public and commercial entities

Legal Challenges
- Centered on what is a “place of public accommodation”?  
- DOJ/OCR rely on revised Section 508/WCAG 2.0 for guidance
ACCESSIBILITY LAWS & GUIDELINES: 508, WCAG, AND CVAA

Rehabilitation Act (1973): 508
- Covers federal agencies and states/Orgs that have adopted 508
- Revised 508 includes WCAG 2.0 Levels A and AA

21st Century Video and Communications Act, CVAA (2010): Title II
- Requires CC content on TV be CC when distributed online
- Who’s responsible for compliance?

WCAG 2.0
- Primarily focused on web-based content
- Integrated into revised 508 standards

WCAG Version 2.0, Level AA

Section 508
Legal Settlements: Netflix, edX, FedEx

National Association of the Deaf (NAD), et al. v Netflix
- **Issue:** mail-order DVDs (captioned) vs. online streaming content (not captioned)
- **Settlement:** Netflix was required to caption all online streaming content by 2014
- Redefined “places of public accommodation” – not limited to just physical structures

NAD vs. Harvard/MIT (edX)
- **Issue:** lack of captioning or inaccurate captioning (YouTube) provided for online course materials
- **Settlement:** Web, platform, and mobile apps must conform to WCAG 2.0 AA; hire ICT accessibility staff; implement ICT accessibility policies; conduct ICT accessibility training

EEOC vs. FedEx
- **Issues:** Failure to provide ASL or closed captioning for training videos; failure to make modifications to sound sensitive equipment (moving equipment, scanners, etc.)
- Still in litigation
ACCESSIBILITY LAWSUITS: Resolution Agreements (Captions)

- Univ. of Miami-Ohio (2016)*
- Univ. of Montana (2014)*
- Youngstown State (2014)*
- SCTCS (2013)*
- Univ. of Kentucky (2012)*
- Ohio State Univ. (2010)*

- All cases reference a lack of captions, inaccurate captions, and/or video with no audio descriptions on websites and in online courses.
- Technically, any resolution requiring WCAG 2.0 compliance is indirectly requiring captioning.
World Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG): Time-based media

- **Level A (minimum)** – *Captions, Prerecorded (1.2.2)*: Captions are provided for all prerecorded audio content in synchronized media, except when the media is a media alternative for text and is clearly labeled as such.
  - **Note**: You are not alone. Most institutions are not here yet!

- **Level AA (should)** – *Captions, Live (1.2.4)*: Captions are provided for all live audio content in synchronized media.

- **Level AAA (aspirational)** – *Sign Language, Prerecorded (1.2.6)*: Sign language interpretation is provided for all prerecorded audio content in synchronized media.

GMU-Specific Policies

University Policy 1308 – EIT Accessibility Policy

- Policy mirrors language from existing legal settlements (e.g., definitions, scope)

Streaming Media Policy

- Defines how library and ATI partner to address captioning/audio description of library-owned content
HOW WE GOT STARTED WITH CAPTIONING
WHAT WAS HAPPENING AT MASON?

Timeline: 2011

- National cases had Mason equivalents!
  - Deaf student enrolled in DL section of an IT course

- Who’s paying for this?
  - No budget for captioning

- We were process-challenged
  - Did not have a strategy when these types of issues cropped up

- Poor results from automated solution
  - Faculty, for many reasons, would not clean up their own content
EARLY PITFALLS

Timeline: 2011 – 2013

- Improperly trained student workers
  - Lead to increased costs

- Faculty assumptions
  - Assumed buy-in would not be as challenging

- University’s IT infrastructure was insufficient
  - Existing IT infrastructure did not support streaming media content effectively
EXISTING WORKFLOW
STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIPS (ACC MEDIA)

Disability Services
- Pre-semester faculty workshops

Office of Digital Learning (Provost’s Office)
- OCDI Workshops
- SOUPR

Information Technology Services
- Online Learning Services (Bb, Kaltura)

University Libraries
- Library requests, purchasing & procurement

Communications & Marketing
- Front-facing multimedia content
REQUESTS SUBMITTED
(INDIVIDUAL/BULK)

Request Services Form

ATI Services
Required Field
Name *

Email *

Phone Number

Mason Affiliation *
Faculty/Staff

Responsibilities for Provision of Accessible Media Online and/or in the Classroom

Faculty/Staff acknowledges the following:

- Video(s) will be used for at least one year on their website and/or in the classroom.
- Video(s) transcripts are the property of George Mason University and thus will only be used on GMU websites and/or in classrooms.

ATI will provide the following:

- Copy of video transcript (text file only) completed to at least 98% accuracy.
- ATI will not edit transcripts unless egregious errors are identified (i.e., accuracy or timing of captions)
- Confirmation emails will be sent upon receipt of your submission for processing, at the completion of your request, and as-needed throughout the;

Email & Attach Completed/Saved Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Needed</th>
<th>Material Title</th>
<th>Requester Name</th>
<th>Instructor/Staff Name</th>
<th>Reason for Request?</th>
<th>Course Name (i.e., HIST 100)</th>
<th>Length of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Faculty/Staff Responsibilities

Faculty/Staff acknowledges the following:

- Video(s) will be used for at least one year
- Video(s) transcripts are the property of George Mason University and thus will only be used on GMU websites and/or in classrooms.

ATI will provide the following:

- Copy of video transcript (text file only, at least 98% accurate).
- ATI will not edit transcripts unless egregious errors are identified (i.e., accuracy or timing of captions)
- Confirmation emails sent upon receipt of your submission for processing, at the completion of your request, and as-needed throughout the process.
RECEIVING REQUESTS...

Kaltura (My Media)
- Integrates with Blackboard via My Media
- Faculty can upload videos using Media Upload, Webcam, or Desktop Recorder
- Add ‘captions’ tag

Additional submission methods
- YouTube
- Vimeo
- Library
- 3rd-party
Kaltura, Captioning, & APIs

Kaltura (Video Management Platform)
- Integrates with Blackboard Learn
- APIs with captioning vendors (Cielo24, 3Play Media)
  - Content can be pushed from platform directly to vendor (via tags)
  - Tagging to support different TATs (turnaround times)
  - Vendor uploads completed captions back to video
  - Use vendor supported editing tools for ease of any needed corrections*
  - Additional features (i.e., searchable video)**

* Additional features
** Additional features
Primary KMC Workflow...

Search for specific tags...i.e., ‘captions’

Bulk-tagging for push through vendor API
MANAGING THE WORKFLOW...

Using Kaltura (KMC), AccMedia Coordinator...

- If necessary, pulls videos from other 3rd-party sources – uploads within Kaltura
- Provide technical assistance to faculty/staff who are unfamiliar with Kaltura
- Coordinator adds 'captions' tag(s) to requested content (individual or bulk tagging)
- Determines TAT and tags with vendor appropriate time indication
- Assigns content to faculty member within KMC
- If material comes from Library - works with media services librarian to digitize and caption library content
- Edits any glaring errors before resending to faculty members with transcripts
How files are delivered (Since Jan. 2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Delivery Method</th>
<th># of Videos Delivered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dropbox</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td>1079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaltura</td>
<td>3847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library...</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YouDescribe...</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td>1909</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How files are delivered (By FY)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FY 16</th>
<th>FY 17</th>
<th>FY 18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dropbox</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVD</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaltura</td>
<td>1105</td>
<td>667</td>
<td>1140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

G E O R G E  M A S O N  U N I V E R S I T Y
WHAT THE NUMBERS SHOW
COMPLETED ACCESSIBLE MEDIA REQUESTS, FY12-PRESENT
COMPLIANCE BREAKDOWN VS. ACCOMMODATION
VIDEO BREAKDOWN PER ACADEMIC UNIT
COSTS (FY12-PRESENT)
## Cost Comparisons by FY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FY12*</th>
<th>FY13</th>
<th>FY14</th>
<th>FY15</th>
<th>FY16</th>
<th>FY17</th>
<th>FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Minutes</td>
<td>3,453</td>
<td>7,309</td>
<td>16,419</td>
<td>19,261</td>
<td>17,318</td>
<td>27,738</td>
<td>20,549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Hours</td>
<td>57.55</td>
<td>121.82</td>
<td>278.4</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>462.3</td>
<td>342.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Jobs</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>1034</td>
<td>1296</td>
<td>979</td>
<td>1,610</td>
<td>1,410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (Outsourced)</td>
<td>18.63</td>
<td>68.97</td>
<td>222.55</td>
<td>275.95</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>431.5</td>
<td>315.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (Outsourced)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>1136</td>
<td>909</td>
<td>1,508</td>
<td>1,239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Cost/Min (Outsourced)</td>
<td>$2.94</td>
<td>$2.73</td>
<td>$2.35</td>
<td>$2.19</td>
<td>$1.45</td>
<td>$1.45</td>
<td>$1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (In-house)*</td>
<td>38.92</td>
<td>52.85</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td>45.05</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>30.8</td>
<td>22.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (In-house)*</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3-yr averages

- **Hours:** 364 hours/year
- **Jobs:** 1,333/year
- **Costs:** $1.42/video minute
USING DATA TO ENHANCE DECISION-MAKING
**Who’s Using the Service?**

- Over 378 faculty/staff members have made requests

- Top 5 Schools/Colleges/Units making requests
  - Volgenau School of Engineering
  - College of Humanities and Social Sciences
  - College of Education & Human Development
  - School of Business
  - College of Science

- Reasons for Request
  - Compliance for DE Course – 70%
  - Compliance for F2F Course – 3%
  - Compliance for Websites – 5%
  - Disability Accommodation – 22%
Next Steps

- **Assess Workflow**
  - Continue working with stakeholders (DS, ODL, Library, ITS)
  - Continue tracking media, finding new areas for tracking

- **Continue to improve campus buy-in**
  - Targeted marketing (Semi-annual mailings)
  - Semester Faculty/Staff Surveys
  - Semester Student Surveys (c/o DS)
  - Social Media Outreach – via @AccessibleMason Twitter
  - Faculty/Staff Trainings (each semester c/o DS, ODL)
  - Online Course Reviews (c/o ODL)

- **Improve costs/timelines**
ADDITIONAL INITIATIVES
MAAPs (Mason Academic Accessibility Plans)

- Focuses students with unique and challenging academic needs (high-risk)
- Targets their faculty (current and future), degree programs, department chairs, etc.
STATEWIDE CAPTIONING/TRANSCRIPTION RFP

• **VHEPC** – Virginia Higher Education Procurement Consortium *(established Dec 2014)*
  
  • Contracts were established with the intent to allow for cooperative procurement
  
  • In addition to VASCUPP members (See below), includes Virginia Community College System (23 campuses), CNU, and UVA-Wise

• **VASCUPP members** – Virginia Association of State College and University Purchasing Professionals
  
  • 11 member institutions (GMU, JMU, UVA, VT, ODU, Radford, VCU, VMI, William & Mary, Longwood, and UMW)
• Allows for:

  • **Reduce overall costs** for all through collective purchasing (e.g., higher education, executive branch agencies, etc.)
  • **Capacity-building** opportunities
  • **In-state modeling** (distributed, centralized, 2-yr, 4-yr, etc.)
  • Institutional **competition**
  • **Win-win** for vendors and institutions
RFP Timeline

- **Sept 2017**
  - Started bringing partner institutions together in Fall 2017
  - Some were already using existing GMU contracts
  - WebEx discussions (Assessed needs, Current workload)
- **Jan 2018**
  - Came up with collective general requirements
- **Feb 2018**
  - RFP draft revisions completed, sent out to vendors
- **April/May 2018**
  - Received 9 bids
- **June 2018**
  - Settled on 3 vendors
- **Aug/Sept 2018 (anticipated)**
  - Contract should be executed in coming month(s)
THINGS TO CONSIDER FOR YOUR INSTITUTION...

- **Budget** (i.e., Where’s the money coming from?)
  - What’s your budget?

- **Build infrastructure** (i.e., budget, tools, staffing, partners)
  - In-house (i.e., students, staff/faculty) vs. Outsourcing

- **Institutional Culture**
  - Distributed vs. Centralized
  - You need a good steward!

- **Identify your stakeholders** (i.e., What are your priorities?)
  - Front-facing websites
  - Online learning
  - Faculty teaching students with sensory impairments

- **Develop policies and procedures**

- **Educate, Educate, Educate!!**
CONTACTING US

Assistive Technology Initiative (ATI)

4400 University Drive, MSN 6A11
Aquia Building, Rm. 238
Fairfax, VA 22030

Phone: 703-993-4329
Fax: 703-993-4743
E-mail: ati@gmu.edu
Web: http://ati.gmu.edu,
Twitter: @AccessibleMason