Advanced Workflows for Closed Captioning in Higher Education

Kara Zirkle, IT Accessibility Coordinator, GMU
Lily Bond, Director of Marketing, 3Play Media
Agenda

- Laws & Lawsuits Impacting Closed Captioning Requirements
- Workflow Type: Integrations
- George Mason University’s Workflow, Timeline, & Cost
- Workflow Type: DIY Captioning
- Workflow Type: Using APIs
- API Example: Penn State
- Q&A
Accessibility Laws: 508, 504

Rehabilitation Act: Sections 508, 504
- Covers federal agencies and orgs with federal funding
- Assistive Technology Act
Accessibility Laws: ADA

Rehabilitation Act: Sections 508, 504
- Covers federal agencies and orgs with federal funding
- Assistive Technology Act

ADA: Titles II, III
- Covers public and commercial entities
- Lawsuits: What is a “place of public accommodation”? 
Accessibility Laws: CVAA

Rehabilitation Act: Sections 508, 504
- Covers federal agencies and orgs with federal funding
- Assistive Technology Act

ADA: Titles II, III
- Covers public and commercial entities
- Lawsuits: What is a “place of public accommodation”?  

CVAA
- Covers Internet content that aired on TV
- Includes video clips
- Copyright owner bears responsibility
Closed Captioning Lawsuits: Netflix

- National Association of the Deaf (NAD), et al. v Netflix
  - What constitutes a place of public accommodation?
  - How did the NAD originally bring Netflix under the ADA?
  - Settlement & implications
Closed Captioning Lawsuits: Harvard/MIT

- National Association of the Deaf (NAD), et al. v Netflix
- **NAD vs. Harvard & MIT**
  - Current state of the case
  - Implications for higher education
  - Changing scope of the ADA
Integrations
Integrations: How Do They Work?

First, link your accounts

Captioning Vendor

Video Platform

1. Tag your video for captioning

2. Captioning vendor will get started on your captions

Captions will post back automatically
Integrations: In-Depth Look

1. Link accounts
2. Upload media into video platform (e.g., Mediasite or YouTube)
3. Link accounts
4. Captions are automatically posted back to platform for viewing
5. Output files stored and available for download in any format from some vendors’ account systems

File is automatically sent to vendor

Captions text editor available for use if needed by some vendors

2. Option: upload media directly to your captioning account
3. Transcription and captioning process is kicked off
Timelines, Workflows and Costs

Lessons Learned, Achievements Made and Workflows Advanced
Aug 2009 – Purchase of DocSoft (Faculty and Staff to use on their own)

Jan 2011 – Submitted Captioning Proposal (ATI DIY, we do it, you send it)

June 2011 - Proposal Approved (hired students and purchased technology)

July – Sept 2011 Training and Launch of Pilot Project (Small group of Instructional Designers)

Jan and Spring 2012 – Time to update and better our process from lessons learned. Full time Accessible Media Coordinator was hired.

Jan and Spring 2012 – Time to update and better our process from lessons learned. Full time Accessible Media Coordinator was hired.

2013 – Started using a Hybrid method of moving from DIY to more Vendor. (See costing slide)

Spring 2014 – Kaltura implemented and a RFP (Request for Proposal) was sent out for captioning

Spring 2015 – IFB (Invitation for Bid) all money comes from overhead funds from the University due to high costs and demand.

Today – We have multiple contracts with captioning vendors to help with cost based upon turn around time costs, SME topics, etc.
Do It Yourself - Accessible Media

*Link opens in a new window.

Captions & Transcripts

Here are some resources for you to provide your own captions and transcripts based on the video server you are using. These resources are also available in our Guide to Creating Accessible Electronic Materials (PDF).

- Vimeo – Manually Adding Captions (PDF)
- YouTube – Adding Captions or Transcripts (PDF)
- *Audio Description: Do-It-Yourself with You Describe

Accessible Video Players

AccessibilityOz has created OzPlayer, a fully accessible video player with keyboard accessibility, captions and a transcript:

- *Visit this link to download OzPlayer

The American Foundation for the Blind (AFB), also has an accessible HTML5 video player. Visit the link below for the free download.

- *Visit this link to download the AFB video player
## Cost Comparisons by FY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FY12*</th>
<th>FY13</th>
<th>FY14</th>
<th>FY15</th>
<th>FY 16 (so far)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Minutes</td>
<td>3,453</td>
<td>7,309</td>
<td>16,419</td>
<td>19,261</td>
<td>14,766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Hours</td>
<td>57.55</td>
<td>121.82</td>
<td>278.4</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Jobs</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>1034</td>
<td>1296</td>
<td>885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (Outsourced)</td>
<td>18.63</td>
<td>68.97</td>
<td>222.55</td>
<td>275.95</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (Outsourced)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>1136</td>
<td>876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Cost/Min (Outsourced)</td>
<td>$2.94</td>
<td>$2.73</td>
<td>$2.35</td>
<td>$1.88</td>
<td>$1.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (In-house)*</td>
<td>38.92</td>
<td>52.85</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td>45.05</td>
<td>2.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (In-house)*</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Costs (In-house)*</td>
<td>$13,723.45</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Cost/Min (In-house)*</td>
<td>$5.87</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Savings</td>
<td>($6,858.55)*</td>
<td>$10,163.36</td>
<td>$13,420.31</td>
<td>$9,050.83</td>
<td>$7,180.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In FY12, all in-house work is attributed solely to grad students. That work is now shared amongst a number of Mason staff/faculty since FY13.
What the overall numbers show...

Completed Acc Media Requests

- FY12: 147
- FY13: 337
- FY14: 1034
- FY15: 1296
- FY16 (so far): 885
Website and Videos

- University Web Audit
  - Provided accessibility reviews, which were included in University’s web audit, number of documents were included but number of videos were impossible.
  - Reviewed *Priority 1* and *Priority 2* websites (over 110 websites)
    - **P1**: Academics, Admissions, Financial Aid, Student Health, Housing, Visitors, HR
    - **P2**: Individual College and School websites
      - Page scans 5 levels deep, up to 100 pages
      - Reports provided to Web Developer

- University Web Overhaul
  - Phase 1 websites redesigned.
  - Raise in captioning requests for websites
Video Breakdown per Academic Unit

FY 14  FY 15  FY 16 (so far)

CEHD  30   162  30
CHHS  48   96   68
CHSS  205  361  96
CDE   7    1    4
COS   177  170  177
CVPA  9    1    9
ITS   0    2    0
Provost 0   5   0
SCAR  100  67   100
Business 47  27  25
SPGIA  50   4    50
Univ Life 36  20  36
Engineering 76 32  187

FY 14  FY 15  FY 16 (so far)
Who’s Using the Service?

• Over 180 faculty/staff members have made requests

• Top 3 Schools/Colleges/Units making requests
  – Volgenau School of Engineering
  – **SPGIA (School of Policy, Government, and International Affairs) – Due to Web Overhaul**
  – College of Science

• Reasons for Request
  – Compliance for DE Course – 74.9% (up 1.7%)
  – Compliance for F2F Course – 0% (down 1.1%)
  – **Web Compliance – 7.5% (up 4.2%) – Due to web overhaul**
  – Disability Accommodation – 17.8 % (down 4.6%)
Improved Access to Library Resources

• How does this effect captioning?

Library purchases media databases as well as provide media to be loaned out. Captioning and audio description still come in as requests.

• Library established an **Accessibility Coordinator/Instruction Designer** position
  - Liaison between our office and library staff/resources

• This has led to:
  - Improved hand-off when captioning library resources
  - Improved coordination with Copyright Office
  – Informal process for review of library technology purchases – For example, helping library Procurement to ensure responsibility of captioning isn’t solely on Mason if a media database is purchased.
What the breakdowns show part 3

Breakdown of Delivery of Media File

- Email: 546
- Kaltura: 1326
- Library (Databases): 26
- Youtube: 1640
Next Steps

• Assess Workflow
  • Continue working with stakeholders (DE, Library)
  • Continue tracking media, finding new areas for tracking
  • All options on table!

• Continue to improve campus buy-in
  • MARKETING, MARKETING, MARKETING!
  • Targeted marketing (Semi-annual mailings)
  • Faculty/Staff Trainings (monthly)
  • DE Course Reviews
  • Department Champions to help spread the word
  • Everything located in one place

• Improve costs/timelines
  • RFP for captioning to was used to reduce per minute costs
  • Outsource ALL requests. Doing this allows more time for the Accessible Media Coordinator to work hands on with various faculty and departments to make the process easier which builds more overall business.
DIY Captioning Workflows
What Is “Good Enough” for Captioning?

- ADA, Section 508, Section 504, CVAA, and FCC all state:
  - An equivalent alternative must be provided video content

- How Accurate Is Accurate?
  -

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Word-to-Word Accuracy</th>
<th>1 of x Words Incorrect</th>
<th>8-Word Sentence Accuracy</th>
<th>10-Word Sentence Accuracy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td>1 of 2</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67%</td>
<td>1 of 3</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75%</td>
<td>1 of 4</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85%</td>
<td>1 of 7</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90%</td>
<td>1 of 10</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95%</td>
<td>1 of 20</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98%</td>
<td>1 of 50</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99%</td>
<td>1 of 100</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Google says their accuracy rate for YouTube automatic captions is ≅80%:

- 80% accuracy
- 1 in 5 words is incorrect
- An 8-word sentence will be ≅17% accurate
- A 10-word sentence will be ≅11% accurate

What was really spoken: “flax, double the vanilla - always double the vanilla - cinnamon”
Create a Transcript for Your Video

This short video shows you how to get started in the 3Play Media account system. First, log in to account.3playmedia.com. In Settings, you can specify your Transcription Settings, Favorite Formats, and other preferences which will help to personalize and simplify the captioning, subtitling, and transcription process. In particular, make sure that you specify your preference for speaker identification. You can upload video or audio files from your computer, from links, via FTP, or directly from your video platform or lecture capture system.

Click Upload to select a service, turnaround time, and file location. If you already have a transcript for your media file, you can use the automated transcript ...

Note: transcription takes 5-6x real time
# Create Your Own WebVTT or SRT File

## WebVTT (.vtt)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:00:00.000 --&gt; 00:00:03.830</td>
<td>align:middle line:90% This short video shows you how to get started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:00:03.830 --&gt; 00:00:05.970</td>
<td>align:middle line:84% in the 3PlayMedia account system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:00:05.970 --&gt; 00:00:08.574</td>
<td>align:middle line:84% First, log in to account.3playmedia.com.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## SRT (.srt)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>00:00:00,000 --&gt; 00:00:03,830</td>
<td>This short video shows you how to get started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>00:00:03,830 --&gt; 00:00:05,970</td>
<td>in the 3PlayMedia account system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>00:00:05,970 --&gt; 00:00:08,574</td>
<td>First, log in to account.3playmedia.com.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>00:00:08,574 --&gt; 00:00:10,240</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Use YouTube for Captioning

*YouTube provides a great starting point for captioning!*

- Create transcript and set timings, then download SRT file for use in other video platforms
- Upload video to YouTube and download SRT file of automatic captions to edit
Edit the YouTube Automatic Captions
FCC Standards for Caption Quality

- Caption accuracy
  - Must match spoken words to fullest extent possible and include non-verbal information
  - Allows some leniency for live captioning

- Caption synchronization
  - Must coincide with their spoken words and sounds to the greatest extent possible

- Program completeness
  - Captions must run from the beginning to the end of the program

- Onscreen caption placement
  - Captions should not block other important visual content
Best Practices for Captioning Quality

**Transcription Standards**

- Spelling & Grammar
- Speaker Identification
- Sound Effects
- Punctuation
  - “(SHOUTING) Hi” vs. “Hi!”
- Verbatim

**Caption Frame Standards**

- Minimum Duration
- Caption Placement
- Silence
- # Characters per line
- Font
- Synchronization
Caption Formats

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Format Type</th>
<th>Use Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SCC</td>
<td>Broadcast, iOS, web media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMPTE-TT</td>
<td>Web media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAP</td>
<td>Broadcast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBU.STL</td>
<td>PAL Broadcast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFXP</td>
<td>Flash players</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRT</td>
<td>YouTube and web media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WebVTT</td>
<td>Emerging HTML5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAMI</td>
<td>Windows Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QT</td>
<td>QuickTime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STL</td>
<td>DVD encoding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT.XML</td>
<td>Captionate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RT</td>
<td>Real Media</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SRT Example**

2
00:00:00,220 --> 00:00:03,020
Hi I'm Arne Duncan, the Secretary of Education.

3
00:00:03,020 --> 00:00:06,380
Education has been a lifelong passion and calling for me.

4
00:00:06,380 --> 00:00:07,960
My mother started an inner-city tutoring

**SCC Example**

01:02:53:14 94ae 94ae 9420 9420
01:02:55:14 942c 942c
01:03:27:29 94ae 94ae 9420 9420
Using APIs
What Is an API?

- “Application Programing Interface”
- Graphical User Interface (human to computer) vs. Application Programming Interface (computer to computer)
- APIs allow two computers to interact with each other by passing data and commands
What’s So Great About APIs?

- Design workflows that suit your business needs
- Automate repetitive manual tasks (esp. at scale)
- These reduce:
  - Cost
  - Labor hours
  - Organizational and workflow complexity
What Can I Do with an API?

- Manage caption/translation/alignment jobs
  - View media resource information
  - Request captioning, translation, or alignment
  - Download finished captions and transcripts
- Add interactive transcripts to your video
API Example

- Penn State’s workflow
- Reason: scale
- Benefits: automation, cost
- Workflow
Take Part in a Research Study on Closed Captioning in Higher Education

- **Institutional Solutions for and Student Perceptions of Closed Caption and Transcript Use in Institutions of Higher Education**
  - A collaborative research project funded by 3Play Media and the Oregon State University Ecampus Research Unit

- **Incentives**
  - Five 10-hour captioning credits valued by 3Play Media at $1,500 will be raffled to institutional participants who elect to share their email address for the purpose of the raffle
  - Institutions will also receive anonymous aggregated data for their institution

- **Two reports will be created for this project: one regarding data from the student survey and one regarding data from the institutional survey**

- **Principal Investigator:**
  - Dr. Katie Linder, kathryn.linder@oregonstate.edu, 541-737-4629
Questions

Kara Zirkle
IT Accessibility Coordinator
George Mason University
kzirkle1@gmu.edu
703-993-9815
http://ati.gmu.edu

Lily Bond
3Play Media
lily@3playmedia.com
617-764-5189x119