From Accommodations to Inclusion: How to Build a Captioning Budget That Benefits All Students
Who is here?

Christopher Phillips  
Electronic and Information Technology Accessibility Coordinator, Utah State University

Robert Starr  
Accessible Media Coordinator, George Mason University

Scott Ready  
Customer Success & Accessibility Evangelist, Verbit
The road to Inclusion

The path Utah State University is on

The path George Mason University is on

The path forward for Your Institution

Q & A’s
The biggest hindrance to digital accessibility in education . . . The underlying perception that digital accessibility is optional.
Verbit Maturity Model™

for Higher-Ed

Emerging
- Disclosed Disability
- Student Requested
- Course Access
- Individual File
- Quick Turn Around Time
- Centralized Administration
- Disability Services Department
- Lack Priority on Accessibility
- Item Remediation

Applying
- Disclosed Disability
- Student Requested
- Course Access
- Bulk File Management
- System Integration
- Centralized Administration
- Disability Services Department
- Faculty Development
- Course Remediation

Infusing
- Various Learning Preferences
- Student Course Equity
- Program Access
- Various Academic Scenarios
- Distributed Workflows
- Distributed Administration
- Access Infused Culturally
- Distributed Ownership
- Program Remediation

Incorporating
- All Students
- Educational Equity
- Institutional Wide Access
- Institutional Solution
- Distributed Budget
- Institutional Administration
- Strategic Access Plan
- Access by Design
- Data Driven Results

Reactive
- Reactive Individual Accommodation
- Reactive Course Accommodation

Planned Program Inclusion

Designed Institutional Inclusion

Proactive
Utah State University

Christopher Phillips
Highlight the Benefits!

SPECIAL DEAL
Limited time offer!

*term and conditions apply
Benefits

- Second Language Learners
- Literacy
- Learner Preference
- Noisy Contexts
- Availability of Transcript
- Findability
Benefits

- Second Language Learners
- Literacy
- Learner Preference
- Noisy Contexts
- Availability of Transcript
- Findability
Especially when you caption videos for accommodations
Reframe the Budget Conversation
Instead of:

Why would we create a **budget** to caption more videos?
Change the conversation to:

Why wouldn’t we provide a **budget** to caption more videos given the tremendous benefits that come from captioning?
Leverage Frustration
If there is a problem you can’t fix, make the problem bigger until someone who can fix it does.
Track Expenses
Minutes, Money, Jobs

Money, Minutes and Jobs

01 January 01 March 01 May 01 July 01 September 01 November
Average Cost per Minute
George Mason University

Robert Starr
What was happening at Mason?

Prior to 2009 – No Solution
August 2009 – Purchased Docsoft:AV Unit
• ATI paid 1/3 upfront costs, Kellar Institute for Human disAbilities (KIHd) covered rest
• 50/50 split of annual maintenance costs w/ KIHd

After 1st year…still no captioning!
• Unit was not being utilized
• Pushback from faculty/staff
  • Lack of time/resources

2011
National cases had Mason equivalents!
• Deaf student enrolled in DL section of an IT course
Who’s paying for this?
• No budget for captioning
What was happening at Mason?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Proposal submitted for in-house captioning services</td>
<td>• Avg. Cost per minute (Outsourced): $2.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Staffing: 1PT to FT, 2 grad students</td>
<td>• Avg. Cost per minute (Student): $5.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Technology (laptops, Docsoft licensing, etc.)</td>
<td>• Cost savings (Students): 2,335 * $2.94 = $6,864.90 - $13,707.62 = ($6,842.13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unexpected costs (outsourcing captioning and Audio Description)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Progress and Hindrances

Progress
• **Inclusion!** University shift (Kaltura)
• Growing predictability
• RFP for captioning/transcription
• Improved workflows
• Relationship growth from faculty/staff
• Technology advancement
  • Vendors capabilities
  • Digital access to media
• Strategic planning

Hindrances
• A lot of manual hand-off
• Lack of predictability
• GA’s couldn’t handle most immediate requests
• Hire/Lose/Re-hire SWs
• Outsourcing costs (in early years)
• Early faculty/staff buy-in
Centralized Captioning Model

Process overview
• Faculty/staff submit captioning request
• ATI processes request and records/tracks request information
• Download file from YouTube/3rd-party Website, if file not in Kaltura
• Push videos from Kaltura to vendor server
• Video pushed from Kaltura to Blackboard.
• ATI pays costs
Strategic Partnership

Ongoing Relationships
- Disability Services
- Information Technology Unit
  - Online Learning Services
  - Instructional Design Team
- University Libraries
- Distance Education
- Communications & Marketing
Who’s Using the Service?

- Over 146 faculty/staff members have made requests for 168 courses
- Top 3 Schools/Colleges making requests
  - College of Education and Human Development (723 videos)
  - College of Health and Human Services (397 videos)
  - College of Humanities and Social Sciences (366 videos)
- Reasons for Request
  - Compliance for DE Course – 81.1%
  - Compliance for F2F Course – 2.3%
  - Compliance for Websites – 2.5%
  - Disability Accommodation – 14.1%
Completed Accessible Media Requests
FY12-Present
## Cost Comparison by FY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FY12</th>
<th>FY13</th>
<th>FY14</th>
<th>FY15</th>
<th>FY16</th>
<th>FY17</th>
<th>FY18</th>
<th>FY19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Minutes</td>
<td>3,453</td>
<td>7,309</td>
<td>16,419</td>
<td>19,261</td>
<td>17,318</td>
<td>27,738</td>
<td>20,549</td>
<td>40,135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Hours</td>
<td>57.55</td>
<td>121.82</td>
<td>278.4</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>462.3</td>
<td>342.5</td>
<td>668.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Jobs</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>1,034</td>
<td>1,296</td>
<td>979</td>
<td>1,610</td>
<td>1,410</td>
<td>2,902</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (Outsourced)</td>
<td>18.63</td>
<td>68.97</td>
<td>222.55</td>
<td>275.95</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>431.5</td>
<td>315.3</td>
<td>668.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (Outsourced)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>1,136</td>
<td>909</td>
<td>1,508</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td>2,894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Cost/Min (Outsourced)</td>
<td><strong>$2.94</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.73</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.35</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.19</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.45</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.45</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.35</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.31</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours (In-house)</td>
<td>38.92</td>
<td>52.85</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td>45.05</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>30.8</td>
<td>22.85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs (In-house)</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>169</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**3-yr averages**
- Hours: 491.2 /year
- Jobs: 1974 /year
- Costs: $1.37 /video minute
Into The Future

Assess Workflow
• Continue working with stakeholders (DS, ODL, Library)
• Continue tracking media, finding new areas for tracking

Continue to improve campus buy-in
• Targeted marketing (Semi-annual mailings)
• Semester Faculty/Staff Surveys
• Semester Student Surveys (D/HOH)
• Faculty/Staff Trainings (each semester)
• MAAPS Initiative – Mason Academic Accessibility Plans

Improve costs/timelines
• Statewide Captioning & Transcription contract
The Path Forward

How does this apply to your institution?
The Path Forward

What are some key takeaways?
Q & A
Thank You.